

MEETING AGENDA

Meeting/Project Name:	Public Hearings on The Waste Tyre Management Plans		
Date of Meeting: (MM/DD/YYYY)	21/05/2018	Time:	09h00
Meeting Facilitator:	Chairperson: Ms N Ngcaba	Location:	Environment House, (Departmental of Environmental Affairs Head Office), Pretoria

Meeting Objective

- To give an overview of Extended Producer Responsibility in relation to Tyre Industry Plan
- To provide equal opportunity to all plan owners to present an overview of their submissions
- To provide equal opportunity to all interested and affected parties to engage on the submitted plans
- To provide a forum for open dialogue in order to clarify ambiguities and challenge plan owners on the sufficiency of the plan in line with overall national environmental strategy
- To provide an update from the Waste Bureau and information on the current network of tyre operations, infrastructure and participants with due compliance to Promotion of Access to Information Act (PAIA) and Personal Information Act (POPI)

Meeting Agenda	
Topic	Owner
Opening and Welcome	Nosipho Ngcaba, Chairperson, Director General, DEA
Apologies	Nosipho Ngcaba, Chairperson, Director General, DEA
Purpose of the meeting	Nosipho Ngcaba, Chairperson, Director General, DEA
DEA Presentation on regulations and the S28 notice	Linda Garlipp, Chief Director, DEA
Presentation on litigation and liquidation: REDISA	Vanessa Bendeman, Chief Director, DEA
Presentation–EPR vision and outlook for the tyre industry	Mark Gordon, Deputy Director General, DEA
Presentations on the proposed Waste Tyre Management Plans	
SATRUCO	Nathi Gaisa, Chairman Hugh Mtshali, CEO Nomathemba Kubheka, Board member Johann Lehmann, COO
Question and answer session	Interested and affected parties, plan proponents
TWAMISA	Zuzana Hegerova, Plan Owner
Question and answer session	Interested and affected parties, plan proponents
JPC Energy	Not in attendance
Question and answer session	Interested and affected parties, plan proponents
Evergreen Pty (Ltd)	George Mapuma, Director
Question and answer session	Interested and affected parties, plan proponents
Waste Management Bureau operations	Nolwazi Tetyana, Specialist Advisor
Discussions	Interested and affected parties, Waste Bureau
Way forward	Nosipho Ngcaba, Chairperson, Director General, DEA
Closure	Nosipho Ngcaba, Chairperson, Director General, DEA

MEETING MINUTES

Meeting/Project Name:	Public Hearings on The Waste Tyre Management Plans		
Date of Meeting: (MM/DD/YYYY)	21/05/2018	Time:	09h00
		Location:	Environment House, (Departmental of Environmental Affairs Head Office), Pretoria

2. Attendance at Meeting¹

Name	Role	Department/Division
Nosipho Ngcaba	Director General	Department of Environmental Affairs
Mark Gordon	Deputy Director General	Department of Environmental Affairs
Linda Garlipp	Chief Director	Department of Environmental Affairs
Vanessa Bendeman	Chief Director	Department of Environmental Affairs
Nolwazi Tetyana	Specialist Advisor	Waste Management Bureau
Hugh Mtshali	CEO	SATRUCO
Nathi Gaisa	Chairperson	SATRUCO
Nomathemba Khubeka	Board member	SATRUCO
Johann Lehmann	COO	SATRUCO
Zuzana Hegerova	Plan owner	TWAMISA
Ebrahim Patel	Director	Evergreen
George Mapuma	Director	Evergreen
Ayub Patel	Engineer	Evergreen

¹ Attendance register captured is not exhaustive. This list therefore only contains the names of the presenters and Department representatives.

Meeting/Project Name:	Public Hearings on The Waste Tyre Management Plans		
Date of Meeting: (MM/DD/YYYY)	21/05/2018	Time:	09h00
		Location:	Environment House, (Departmental of Environmental Affairs Head Office), Pretoria
Summary of presentations			
Topic		Owner	
<p>Opening & Welcome</p> <p>Purpose and background for an industry waste management plan:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> Minister made a call for Industry Tyre Waste Management Plans with a deadline of 31st December 2017, in terms of NEMA Waste Act, S28 Minister received 4 plans from the following organisations: <ul style="list-style-type: none"> SATRUCO, submitted on the 31st December 2017 TWAMISA, submitted on the 30th December 2017 JPC ENERGY, submitted on the 11th December 2017 EVERGREEN ENERGY, submitted on the 16th November 2017 The Minister's notice, published 7 May 2018, called for public hearings; accordingly the 4 plans were made public Sessions have been arranged in 7 provinces within the period of 30 days, taking into account the geographic spread The Department is required to follow due process and thus the sessions are recorded <p>Communicated purpose of the sessions:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> To give an overview of Extended Producer Responsibility in relation to Tyre Industry Plan To provide equal opportunity to all plan owners to present an overview of their submissions To provide equal opportunity to all interested and affected parties to engage on the submitted plans To provide a forum for open dialogue in order to clarify ambiguities and challenge plan owners on the sufficiency of the plan in line with overall national environmental strategy To provide an update from the Waste Bureau and information on the current network of tyre operations, infrastructure and participants with due compliance to PAIA and POPI 		<p>Nosipho Ngcaba, Chairperson, DG, DEA</p>	
<p>Faciliators introduced themselves and the house rules. They communicated that:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> Questions open to the floor shall be limited to ONE question per person per round, in order to allow as many participants as possible to voice their views When asking a question or presenting a statement, please state your name and organisation for the record Times allotted to tea breaks and lunch shall be respected to maintain all objectives of the programme Please respect speakers and plan owners as they speak – allow them to make their point 		<p>Tebogo Skwambane,, Independent Facilitator</p>	

Meeting/Project Name:	Public Hearings on The Waste Tyre Management Plans		
Date of Meeting: (MM/DD/YYYY)	21/05/2018	Time:	09h00
		Location:	Environment House, (Departmental of Environmental Affairs Head Office), Pretoria
DEA Presentation on Regulations and the S28 Notice			Linda Garlipp, Chief Director
<p>DEA presented an overview of regulations for an industry waste tyre management plan:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • The National Environmental Management: Waste Act No. 59 of 2008 (NEMWA) regulates waste management in South Africa • S28(1) empowers the Minister to require a person or category of persons that generates waste to prepare and submit an industry waste tyre management plan • In terms of this section the Minister called on tyre producers, any other person, category of persons or industry that generates waste (and by implication persons who have the support base of waste generators) to submit waste tyre management plans <p>DEA communicated the terms and process for the public consultations:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Based on section 32 (5A) of NEMWA, provisions are made for a consultation process • Section 31 (1) allows the Minister to: <ul style="list-style-type: none"> ○ approve a plan in writing on certain conditions and give directions on the implementation of the plan ○ require additional information to be submitted ○ require amendments to be made to the plan ○ reject the plan with reasons or if it does not meet the requirements of the notice published in terms of section 28 <p>DEA communicated regulatory provisions for a transitional plan:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Regulation 12 provides for transitional arrangements in the event that a waste tyre management plan expires, is withdrawn or is terminated and at the time there exists no other industry waste management plan. • In this case, the Waste Management Bureau shall be responsible to facilitate, supervise and control the management of waste tyres in the interim until a new industry waste tyre management plan is approved. • The Bureau may issue instructions for the management of waste tyres; such instructions must be complied with within the timeframe stated in the instruction. • All participants registered with the previous waste tyre management plan shall in the interim register with the Bureau. • All tyre producers must submit to the Bureau the same declarations they submit to SARS in respect of the quantity of tyres produced or imported, on a quarterly basis. • The Bureau must establish a waste tyre forum with all affected industry to deal with governance and operational matters pertaining to the management of waste tyres during the interim, until a new industry waste tyre management plan is approved. 			

Meeting/Project Name:	Public Hearings on The Waste Tyre Management Plans		
Date of Meeting: (MM/DD/YYYY)	21/05/2018	Time:	09h00
		Location:	Environment House, (Departmental of Environmental Affairs Head Office), Pretoria
<p>Presentation on litigation and liquidation: REDISA</p> <p>DEA presented the series of events with regards to REDISA's liquidation and litigation status:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • On the 1st June 2017, Minister brought an application to provisionally liquidate REDISA • On the 8th June 2017, Minister brought an application to liquidate Kusaga Taka Consulting (KTC) • Both companies were placed under provisional liquidation on the respective dates • On the 9th June 2017, Minister obtained a provisional liquidation order against the Product Testing Institute (PTI). The return date has been extended, by agreement, to 12th October 2018 pending the finalisation of the appeals lodged with the Supreme Court of Appeal (SCA) on REDISA and KTC • On the 15th September 2017, High Court placed both REDISA and KTC under final liquidation • REDISA and KTC applied for leave to appeal to the I SCA against the entire judgement and order • The SCA granted the leave to appeal on 14th February 2018. The matter has not yet been allocated a date for hearing by the SCA <p>DEA communicated the performance of the plan between June and September 2017, under the care of the liquidators:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Record of active participants as at June 2017 is as follows: <ul style="list-style-type: none"> ○ 499 micro-collectors ○ 78 transporters ○ 20 depots ○ 15 processors • Total tonnages collected between June and September 2017: <ul style="list-style-type: none"> ○ 29 203.50 Tonnes ○ 16 886.66 Tonnes • Cash resources of REDISA at date of provisional liquidation were R178 547 943 (1st June 2017) • Cash resources of REDISA at date of cessation of operations (30th September 2017) were R 82 451 332 <p>DEA communicated status of assets in line with the liquidation process:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • All REDISA's assets are securely stored, except those which are being used by the WMB as per the interim arrangement • Provided the final liquidation order is upheld by the SCA, provisional liquidators can begin disposal of assets and finalising creditors' claims • Provisional liquidators will lodge a liquidation and distribution account with the Master of the High Court in relation to the administration of REDISA 			<p>Vanessa Bendeman, Chief Director, DEA</p>
<p>Extended producer responsibility (EPR) vision and outlook</p> <p>Summary of the vision:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Problem statement identified: <ul style="list-style-type: none"> ○ Opportunity cost of waste, missed opportunities due to poor infrastructure and skills and underfunding 			<p>Mark Gordon, Deputy Director General, DEA</p>

Meeting/Project Name:	Public Hearings on The Waste Tyre Management Plans		
Date of Meeting: (MM/DD/YYYY)	21/05/2018	Time:	09h00
		Location:	Environment House, (Departmental of Environmental Affairs Head Office), Pretoria
	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> ○ Unsafe and unhealthy outcomes imposed on society due to waste produced ○ Pervasive underpricing in the waste economy ● Value statement introduced: <ul style="list-style-type: none"> ○ Introduced to begin concerted efforts in waste valorisation (extracting value from waste) ○ Incentivising a recycling economy ○ Creating and promoting jobs in the waste economy ○ Diligence in service delivery ○ Governance and revenues in the waste economy ● The desired outcome would be: <ul style="list-style-type: none"> ○ Less waste ○ Diversion of waste ○ Jobs created and sustained ○ The existence of a circular economy ○ Direct benefits to society ○ Streamlined regulatory process ● What the circular economy would imply: <ul style="list-style-type: none"> ○ The need for sustainable growth in the context of the growing pressure of production and consumption on the world's resources and environment. ○ Resources kept within the economy when a product has reached the end of its life, so they can be productively re-used repeatedly to create further value ● Models for government, industry-managed EPR plans and revenue collection: <ul style="list-style-type: none"> ○ Financial instruments to pass on the burden of waste to producers and consumers, and incentivise waste management efforts by the same groups ○ Instruments include incentives and fees for recycling, taxes on extraction of resources, product taxes for consumers, disposal taxes and EPR fees collected from producers ● Provided case studies of EPR policies globally: <ul style="list-style-type: none"> ○ European countries are early adopters and practices contributed to increased recycling rates ○ EPR schemes contributed to reductions of public spending on waste management ● EPR role players include PROs, which are individual schemes mostly applied in business-to-business contexts that organise and finance collective producer responsibilities towards waste management 		

Meeting/Project Name:	Public Hearings on The Waste Tyre Management Plans		
Date of Meeting: (MM/DD/YYYY)	21/05/2018	Time:	09h00
		Location:	Environment House, (Departmental of Environmental Affairs Head Office), Pretoria
SATRUCO			Hugh Mtshali, CEO
<p>CEO introductions, overview of the company and the team:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> The South African Tyre Reuse Company (SATRUCO) was established as an NPC in 2016. Plan drafted is a response to regulation Introduced members of the SATRUCO team present: <ul style="list-style-type: none"> Nomathemba Kubheka (board member) Johann Lehmann (COO) Advocate Nathi Gaisa (Chairman) Vision: to achieve sustainable economic growth through the value chain, a clean and healthy environment, innovative solutions and global competitiveness through the efficient and effective management of waste tyres Mission – to make a critical contribution to waste management in SA by: <ul style="list-style-type: none"> Encouraging a vibrant circular economy approach in the management of waste tyres Ensuring a value chain model for the beneficiation of waste tyres within an EPR methodology Making waste tyre management a national priority Raising public awareness Creating meaningful sustainable jobs through the fostering of SMMEs with a special focus on BBBEE Aim to support disadvantaged communities with a real life story – a transporter in Tembisa whose business opportunity came to an end due to the inefficiencies of the previous plan SATRUCO addresses all types of tyres – a comprehensive integrated plan Plan aims to achieve the support and set-up of infrastructure and processes for reduction & reuse, recycling, energy and treatment & disposal 			
<p>Governance model to implement plan:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> Includes lessons learnt from previous plan; the governance plan includes Treasury, WMB, DEA 7 board members with 2 ex officio members and 1 oversight member: <ul style="list-style-type: none"> Legal, HR and Risk Industry rep Finance Technical Comms Including the CEO (ex officio) DTI representative (ex officio) A rep from Treasury for oversight input Training and research & development managers and an ICT manager Collaboration through a new forum for participants in tyre industry to provide inputs into the plan and discuss industry-wide concerns Other strategic partners to be included: <ul style="list-style-type: none"> WMB Waste Tyre Management Forum – elected members from the industry Provincial operations model to address the fact that the plan is a people-centred plan All provincial plans include the following types of participants: <ul style="list-style-type: none"> Recyclers Transporters 			Nomathemba Khubeka

Meeting/Project Name:	Public Hearings on The Waste Tyre Management Plans		
Date of Meeting: (MM/DD/YYYY)	21/05/2018	Time:	09h00
		Location:	Environment House, (Departmental of Environmental Affairs Head Office), Pretoria
<p>Cost allocation to different initiatives (budget):</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> Have established a well-running call centre, with a planned allocation of 0.5% of the budget to grow and maintain call centre An enterprise development programme with an allocation of 2% <p>How will we measure impact of plan:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> No. of recyclers, processors, no. of sustainable jobs, no. of sustainable downstream businesses (not specified if newly created business directly related to their efforts) Database of research and innovation conducted during its operational period Number of processors developed SATRUCO's annual reports SATRUCO's international conference wherein its achievements will be showcased SATRUCO's real-time data produced by its bespoke IT system Evidence of its engagement with public and private entities, namely, government departments and support services, business and industry, training institutes, the community development service providers, the civic movement and grass roots communities involved in developing the tyre waste economy <p>SATRUCO's readiness:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> SATRUCO has created a team with collective experience of 100 years in the industry The plan has seen an extensive consultation process <ul style="list-style-type: none"> Academics International waste industry participants SETAs Interest has been expressed by processors, recyclers and investors to establish new plants and create new opportunities, skills and technology transfer Has a legal team and a team of chartered accountants to ensure key governance/risk concerns around legal compliance and financial responsibility Social impact is a priority Has an enterprise development team driven from the office of the CEO to drive SMME development Has a bespoke IT plan developed and tested with international experts Has a plan to conduct imbizos in provinces to inform communities of the plan and the opportunities available to them <p>Skills development:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> People skills development includes creating certification for newly skilled trades/people in the value chain <p>Overview of operational plan:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> Process <ul style="list-style-type: none"> Tyre dealers' waste sorted and tyres mutilated, manufacturers' reject tyres, communito collection areas Pre-processing operations, tyre-derived fuel (TDF) manufacturing <ul style="list-style-type: none"> Historical stockpiles as inputs into pre-processing and TDF operations Downsizing process before recycling/pyrolysis Processing (includes pyrolysis ops and crumbing ops) Energy recovery 		<p>Nathi Gaisa</p> <p>Johann Lehmann, COO</p>	
Intended outputs of processing activities:			

Meeting/Project Name:		Public Hearings on The Waste Tyre Management Plans	
Date of Meeting: (MM/DD/YYYY)	21/05/2018	Time:	09h00
		Location:	Environment House, (Departmental of Environmental Affairs Head Office), Pretoria
<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Pyrolysis operations <ul style="list-style-type: none"> ○ HFO ○ Carbon char ○ Steel • Crumbing <ul style="list-style-type: none"> ○ Value-added items such as bricks, tiles, inputs for tarred roads • Intended offtake partners of pre processing activities are energy recovery • Surplus from pre-processing exported as TDF commodity • Plan to abate mining and OTR tyres: <ul style="list-style-type: none"> ○ Address mines' historical stockpiles ○ Address dealers'/mines' arising tyres <p>Targets for collections and processing:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Within 12 months of approval 50% at 69 600 tonnes • Within 24 months of approval 70% at 87 00 tonnes • Within 36 months of approval 80% at 121 800 tonnes • Within 48 months of approval 90% at 156 600 tonnes • Within 60 months of approval 100% at 174 000 tonnes <p>Number of jobs and SMMEs to be created in the industry:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • 160 micro-collection co-ops • 5632 new jobs created <p>Conclusion:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Plan responds equitably and responsibly to legislation. It is a cost-effective, transparent model for recycling and a community-focused plan • Adopts all principles of the circular economy • Plan ensures social impact – with aspects of the plan requiring implementation at the community level • Encourages innovation through its partnerships with scientific bodies in a bid to making South Africa globally competitive • Promotes investment in the country 			
Question		Owner	
<p>Question 1:</p> <p>Would plans, once decided, move to government as custodians, so that if a REDISA situation happens again, government can appoint a new manager easily?</p> <p>Answer 1:</p> <p>From a copyright point of view, SATRUCO cannot say yes or no but that can be discussed with the government once appointment has been made by the Minister.</p>		<p>Silven Montshonyana, Zone 4 Consultancy Services</p>	
<p>Question 2:</p> <p>Do you wish to build on what REDISA has established with R&D?</p> <p>Answer 2:</p> <p>It is difficult to comment on that because we do not know where the patent rights of those R&D reside with. We will definitely investigate the query and assess incorporation thereof into our plan.</p>		<p>Percy Hlangothi, NMMU</p>	

Meeting/Project Name:	Public Hearings on The Waste Tyre Management Plans		
Date of Meeting: (MM/DD/YYYY)	21/05/2018	Time:	09h00
		Location:	Environment House, (Departmental of Environmental Affairs Head Office), Pretoria
<p>Again, with the example of downstream participants, anything previously established by REDISA will be considered in our plan – the cost of acquisition vs. the cost of continuation is feasible for us.</p>			
<p>Question 3: Please clarify:</p> <p>A. the presence of the Waste Tyre Management Forum mentioned in your plan? B. What was the management company in the published plan replaced with?</p> <p>Answer 3: A. The Waste Tyre Forum would be a platform/community for industry participation and commentary in our plan – we used the name and will change the terminology now that we know of this already existing association.</p> <p><i>Interjection from Khotatso Moloji – the question on the management company was not answered</i> B. The management company has not been replaced with anything – the managing company structure was removed because our consultations showed us how this structure created governance issues for REDISA. SATRUCO will operate as an NPC and undertake all operational management of the plan.</p> <p><i>Interjection from DG – Clarification on the legal process</i> The current plans are still a work in progress and these hearings serve the purpose of providing input into submitted plans for ministerial approval. The documents published were what were collected at that time – any changes thereof are communicated in these forums, and additional commentary will be re-written to incorporate those communicated changes.</p> <p>Any comments mentioned in these forums have not yet been taken on board. I think it is correct for the plan proponents to communicate plans to be incorporated for transparency, but we have not published or considered such plans as yet.</p>		<p>Bongani Mthembu, Waste Tyre Forum</p> <p>Nosipho Ngcaba, Chairperson, DG, DEA</p>	
<p>Question 4: In Chapter 1, SATRUCO makes mention of a due diligence process. As current participants we have uncertainties about the due diligence. Why do downstream participants have to be subjected to a due diligence if they are already participants? (The concern is that I may lose my job or my business). Please also outline and provide the criteria for that due diligence.</p> <p>Answer 4: A due diligence is aimed at understanding your business much better as opposed to an elimination process. It gives us an education to help see where we can assist in our unique offering.</p>		<p>Victor Molefe, Waste Tyre Management Forum</p>	
<p>Question 5: I used to work for REDISA as a code 14 truck driver. Their plan was to empower us in an owner-driver scheme and their liquidation resulted in my job loss. What is SATRUCO going to do about people who have been left unemployed as a result of REDISA?</p> <p>Answer 5: <i>Interjection by DG</i></p>		<p>Sphiwe Mogale, Ex Driver</p> <p>Nosipho Ngcaba, Chairperson, DG, DEA</p>	

Meeting/Project Name:	Public Hearings on The Waste Tyre Management Plans		
Date of Meeting: (MM/DD/YYYY)	21/05/2018	Time:	09h00
		Location:	Environment House, (Departmental of Environmental Affairs Head Office), Pretoria
<p>People who have been left out should submit their contracts with REDISA and we will address the fact that they have been left out. There are methods to trace and address this as already undertaken by the Waste Bureau. Please reach out to the Department and provide your details (contracts, business registration, etc.).</p>			
<p>Question 6:</p> <p>All the plans lack detail on the revenue model. The reason why it is important to comment intensely on the revenue model is due to some of the transparencies not provided by REDISA.</p> <p>Where is the SATRUCO revenue model? It indicates that if the tyre waste becomes commoditised, you are able to survive that.</p> <p>Answer 6:</p> <p>Our business plan is our intellectual property – I suppose the Department would, after reward, interrogate our business plan. We have one that incorporates all sorts of issues. But the directive for that review would come from the Department.</p>		<p>William Levi, SABAACI</p>	
<p>Question 7:</p> <p>Do you know what the processing gap is to get to your 2024 target of 100%?</p> <p>Answer 7:</p> <p>Our approach is to subsidise recyclers and reduce their costs. Pre-processing reduces transportation cost due to smaller volumes of material in the pre-processed TDF state. So we shifted expenditure on transportation from large companies who own trucks to pre-processers actually operating in the tyre value chain.</p>		<p>Gavin Young, Chair of SATMC, CEO of Bridgestone</p>	
<p>Question 8:</p> <p>A. Almost 80% of industry workers were not consulted by SATRUCO. How well is your plan informed if you haven't consulted the industry to get reasonable consultation around training, etc.?</p> <p>B. You state that you want to dignify the lives of black people in this plan, yet your <i>Annexure A</i> provides a figure of 3% to the upliftment of black people. How are you bettering black people when allocated budget to their betterment sits at 3%?</p> <p>Answer 8:</p> <p>A. We apologise for that, we were not aware of your existence. On the use of the terminology <i>Waste Tyre Forum</i>, that was a term chosen out of ignorance of your existence.</p> <p>B. We went to SETAs who provide additional funding to industries and convinced them of our plans. We have statements of intent from them indicating their willingness to support the plan. We believe this will add additional financial allocation to training and development beyond the 3% allocation. Our training and development plans also account for participants who will be upskilled via FETs; where national allocation will provide additional financial support towards our targets. Our budgets follow the guidelines of the DTI, so all other line items have impact on the betterment of black people participating in this industry.</p>		<p>Lebogang Selepe, Waste Tyre Management Forum Secretary General</p>	
<p>Question 9:</p> <p>We are currently being workshopped by the Waste Bureau with regards to expiring contracts in September. SATRUCO, shouldn't you be also getting involved in transitional activities if you are truly interested in consulting on the realities of</p>		<p>Duzi Sekgaye</p>	

Meeting/Project Name:	Public Hearings on The Waste Tyre Management Plans		
Date of Meeting: (MM/DD/YYYY)	21/05/2018	Time:	09h00
		Location:	Environment House, (Departmental of Environmental Affairs Head Office), Pretoria
implementing the plan?			
Answer 9:			
Question 10: Chapter 1 (Pg14), SATRUCO speaks of <i>Radical Economic Transformation</i> . What is their definition of <i>Radical Economic Transformation</i> in SATRUCO's eyes? I'd like to link this notion to their procurement spend target of 5% to black people. It does not make sense to be citing <i>Radical Economic Transformation</i> with such a low procurement spend on the betterment of black people.			Motsatsi Thinyane, Waste Tyre Management Forum
Answer 10: We will be focusing on black enterprises vigorously, with most line items of the budget being directed to them directly or indirectly and that is what we meant by <i>Radical Economic Transformation</i> .			
Question 11: The operations aspect of the plan is concerning: did you look at why the previous plans failed? The only difference I can see from an operations perspective is the pre-processing. Supply has never be an issue but rather markets. I urge you to consult us as industry to give you ideas on where we see new markets, etc. <i>Faciliator interjection</i> Please be more specific on your question. Why is pre-processing the only thing considered to be the changing operation in their plan?			Stefan Pfeffer, Enviroprotek
Answer 11: If we try to get recyclers to be more effective in order to grow the industry, we need to support them in a way that includes more than just money. So by producing a pre-processed commodity, it helps recyclers reduce cost on capex expenditures for big machinery. We've also removed the biggest cost in the plan, which is transportation. Reducing the size of whole tries to pre-processed state allows us to allocate money within the industry more efficiently as opposed to spend on larger transport companies with a fleet of vehicles. Additionally, storage space is reduced with smaller volumes of product, thereby also reducing spend on space. Subsidies also allow us to help offset prices of imports and competing in the export market.			Johann Lehmann, COO
TWAMISA <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Introduction of TWAMISA, an initiative of Danubia and a plan focusing solely on OTR tyres • TWAMISA team's background is in high-impact projects in the mining industry around abatement – which informs focus of the proposal Background and rationale: <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Cost of OTR tyres continues to increase as does cost of abatement – therefore a funding deficit exists • The plan's view is to bulk up on abatement activities now, which will create savings (externality) in the future on spend faced by industry/government • The plan for integrated depots implies a holistic solution for remote areas: 			Zuzana Hegerova, Plan Owner, TWAMISA

Meeting/Project Name:	Public Hearings on The Waste Tyre Management Plans		
Date of Meeting: (MM/DD/YYYY)	21/05/2018	Time:	09h00
		Location:	Environment House, (Departmental of Environmental Affairs Head Office), Pretoria
<ul style="list-style-type: none"> ○ Fully compliant shared infrastructure for the region ○ Close the loop locally ● What would these depots look like: <ul style="list-style-type: none"> ○ Start with large OTRs where service providers and infrastructure currently exists with OTRs 45"- 63"because complexity is implied in this segment operationally ○ Room for a depot to accommodate non-OTRs e.g. 1000 square feet ● Value proposition is to produce a comprehensive service to the mines/DEA on tyre waste management in the industry ● Collaboration with another tyre waste management company to handle other tyre waste categories <p>Process overview:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> ● Processing methods – two processes in South Africa: <ul style="list-style-type: none"> ○ Whole tyre is shredded to 50 x 50 pieces ○ Shredding process separating steel and rubber ● Crumb (by-product) usage ● Crumb into pyrolysis – to cascade into blended fuels ● Overview of applications of processing by-product applications: <ul style="list-style-type: none"> ○ Tar roads ○ Carpets ○ Fashion ○ Astro-turf <p>SMME and BEE impact:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> ● Plan proposes sustainable SMEs at all levels of the value chain ● A co-funding platform to pool economic development and social development spend of subscribers ● SMEs would ideally be 51% black owned, partnered with larger, existing specialised operations and provided with an equity ownership deal ● Intent to impact formal sector with job creation through upskilling ● To introduce employee share schemes ● Provide access to black SMEs into capital-intensive spaces ● Improve the empowerment credentials of current industry participants <p>Collection and diversion targets:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> ● Includes 6 years' worth of historical stockpiles ● 27% of historical stockpiles addressed by Year 5 ● 20% of the post-tyre levy backlog addressed by Year 5 ● 100% of the new arising tyres addressed by Year 5 			
<p>Recycling targets:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> ● Increase recycling rates through: <ul style="list-style-type: none"> ○ Incentives and R&D support to SMEs building local recycling capacity ○ Work with the municipalities, SANRAL, etc. to stimulate demand ○ Stimulate independent trading in the industry (i.e. those who generate new and compliant offtake to profit from sale of material) ● Year 1 targets: <ul style="list-style-type: none"> ○ 60% energy recovery, 0% re-use, 40% recycling 			

Meeting/Project Name:	Public Hearings on The Waste Tyre Management Plans		
Date of Meeting: (MM/DD/YYYY)	21/05/2018	Time:	09h00
		Location:	Environment House, (Departmental of Environmental Affairs Head Office), Pretoria
<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Year 2 targets: <ul style="list-style-type: none"> ○ 50% energy recovery, 0% re-use, 50% recycling • Year 3 targets: <ul style="list-style-type: none"> ○ 30% energy recovery, 10% re-use, 60% recycling • Year 4 targets: <ul style="list-style-type: none"> ○ 20% energy recovery, 20% re-use, 60% recycling • Year 5 targets: <ul style="list-style-type: none"> ○ 10% energy recovery, 30% re-use, 60% recycling <p>Local SMEs and jobs over the 5-year plan:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Decent jobs are sustainable jobs • Temporary jobs – in line with some short-term contracts • 242 decent jobs to be created based on submitted plan and 500 temporary jobs to be created in infrastructure development, plant construction, etc. <p>Skills development plan:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • A total of 75 people to be impacted: • Plan to target upskilling via the following initiatives: <ul style="list-style-type: none"> ○ 50 people due to ad hoc specialised training ○ 10 people identified for a bursary programme ○ 10 people for a post-university internship programme ○ 5 people identified for a fast-track management programme <p>Prevention of pollution and ecological degradation:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Impact will be addressed through targets in the waste hierarchy • Competent training and oversight of industry participants by TWAMISA and with incubation partners • National awareness campaigns <p>Administration:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Governance structure ensures that TWAMISA is a management company overseen by an NPC • Single system registration for industry participants • A contract award system and adjudication committee • Single perpetual NPC for the waste tyre stream • TWAMISA to create own NPC if preferred by the Minister, targeting level 3 BEE rating on specialised generic scorecard <p>Planned revenue sources:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • DEA Tyre Levy allocation for TWAMISA plan • Stockpile owners for historical stockpile abatement projects • Non-OTR Industry Manager for shared infrastructure • Sale of material to offtake <p>Plan costs:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Communicated errors in submitted plans on: <ul style="list-style-type: none"> ○ Value of R&D in year 5 ○ % allocation (environmental impact) service providers by year 5 ○ % allocated to set-up and administration costs in year 1 			

Meeting/Project Name:	Public Hearings on The Waste Tyre Management Plans		
Date of Meeting: (MM/DD/YYYY)	21/05/2018	Time:	09h00
		Location:	Environment House, (Departmental of Environmental Affairs Head Office), Pretoria
<ul style="list-style-type: none"> ○ Total value of spend by year 5 • Total spend in year 1 is projected at R109 500 736 • Total spend in year 5 is projected at R1 190 420 396 <p>Pros of multiple managers:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Accelerated roll-out and impact • Reduced costs in the long term • Healthy competitiveness • Reduced risk of monopolistic behaviour by a single PRO • Multiple knowledge contributors • Narrower and thus more achievable focus of each manager • Simplification of delivery and performance evaluation • Specialisation fosters innovation <p>Regular reporting to stakeholders:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Monthly reporting – SMEs to Manco – service-level KPIs embedded into contract (environmental, financial, etc.) • Quarterly reporting <ul style="list-style-type: none"> ○ SMEs to Manco – job numbers and capacity review ○ Manco to NPC – all KPIs in line with plan targets, authority levels and DEA/WB requirements • Semi-annual reporting – SMEs' performance review against contract KPIs by Manco • Annual reporting <ul style="list-style-type: none"> ○ Independent external audit of NPC and Manco against plan (SME normal financial audits) ○ SMEs – annual service provider review by Manco ○ Manco to WB – details of agreements reached with regard to historical stockpiles • Ad hoc – reporting <ul style="list-style-type: none"> ○ SMEs – inspections conducted by Manco at pre-agreed times at the registered sites ○ Regular newsletter, awareness campaigns by Manco to stakeholders <p>Ability to collaborate with another plan:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • This is the preferred method for TWAMISA • Upon mandate for OTR, scope to be assigned to TWAMISA <p>Advantages of TWAMISA plan:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Simple governance model for accountability, transparency and sustainability • Accelerated diversion of waste and recycling by the industry as a whole • Cost efficiencies from abating at scale and nationwide now vs. later for the benefit of both OTR and non-OTR segments • Accelerated transformation through reduced risk of SME failure • Localisation of jobs and procurement in some of the most vulnerable communities 			

Meeting/Project Name:		Public Hearings on The Waste Tyre Management Plans	
Date of Meeting: (MM/DD/YYYY)	21/05/2018	Time:	09h00
		Location:	Environment House, (Departmental of Environmental Affairs Head Office), Pretoria
Question		Owner	
<p>Question 1: 90% of the people I work with depend on and live off of waste picking – what is your plan for these type of people in your OTR model?</p> <p>Answer 1: I understand that waste pickers need more opportunity. However we are not going to promise anything that is not realistic in our targets. Additionally we presume you're referring to waste pickers who pick up passenger tyres. Our plan is specialised and looks specifically at OTR – so the idea of addressing waste pickers cannot be accommodated in our plan. We will however be focusing on creating formal opportunities for people in the industry in the regions identified in our plan through upskilling and ownership schemes.</p>		Bongeka Ngcatshe, Tembisa depot	
<p>Question 2: <i>*This applies to all the plans*</i> The request for exclusivity is an issue because it isn't part of a collaborative economy. <i>*(cited Accelor Mittal in the steel industry asking for import tariff protection and then the next week increased prices for steel for downstream players)*</i> Will this process not be better if TWAMISA agrees to be a consultant with a department – their exclusivity is worrisome for participation from the industry?</p> <p>Answer 2: We recognise that it is difficult for SMEs to participate in the value chain regarding mining. We believe that we are middlemen in connecting them into the value chain. Mines have very strict compliance rules for engaging in their industry and our plan aims to address these particular industries. We do not believe we are exclusive. Mines can contract with whomever they wish, as long as the proof of compliance is there (which we will oversee).</p>		Sylvan Monsthyonyane, Zolfe Consulting	
<p>Question 3: <i>For plan proponents and Waste Bureau</i> There hasn't been an identification of processes and communication thereof, whether it be working with the Waste Bureau or plan managers. Can you provide clarity on processes, transition, timelines and actions that industry participants need to take?</p> <p>Answer 3: I feel your question is best answered by the Department. Being that this is our first in-depth consultation with the Department, we are not privy to the Waste Bureau's contracts and time frames, hence our inclusion of a due diligence process to understand gaps from the transition. <i>Response from the DG</i> Process and transition can be answered in many ways. The Department can provide estimated timelines, but those will be validated against processing capacity actualised in the plans. So we would need more detail on the processing capacity from the resubmitted plans, should there be any.</p>		Louis Liebenberg, Earththread (Pty) Ltd	

Meeting/Project Name:	Public Hearings on The Waste Tyre Management Plans		
Date of Meeting: (MM/DD/YYYY)	21/05/2018	Time:	09h00
		Location:	Environment House, (Departmental of Environmental Affairs Head Office), Pretoria
<p><i>Point of clarification of the question from Louis on processes undertaken by the Waste Bureau</i></p> <p>We identified the need for additional processors due to capacity constraints in the current value chain – depots were full.</p> <p>My understanding of the question – we need a clear view of plan regarding processing capacity.</p> <p>We also currently have new R&D tests to address new offtake in the first year. We believe that R&D will introduce new offtake opportunities which will accommodate the concerns and activities of processors.</p>			
<p>Question 4:</p> <p>A. What are your exact numbers regarding BEE impact?</p> <p>B. I hear that you are subjecting participants to a due diligence. Are you doubting the efforts of the Waste Bureau up to this point?</p> <p>Answer 4:</p> <p>A. We have a 51% ownership BEE mandate for service providers within the plan.</p> <p>B. Our due diligence would identify where companies currently looked after by the Waste Bureau fit into the TWAMISA plan.</p>			Lebogang Selepe, Waste Tyre Forum
<p>Question 5:</p> <p>There exists a conflict of interest. TWAMISA stated in submission that they do not have direct experience in the remediation of OTR tyres but have told this Forum that they have acquired this expertise via advising on tenders prepared for pre-levy stockpile OTR tyres. Additionally, this company is owned by an individual and gives advice to competitors within the value chain.</p> <p>I believe that pointing this out highlights that TWAMISA requires organisations with the expertise to undertake remediation and the owner currently advises industry participants' competitors and partakes in the industry. Based on the above, I believe that TWAMISA should be disqualified from this process.</p> <p>How does TWAMISA plan on managing a national plan with various conflicts of interest?</p> <p>Answer 5:</p> <p>When it comes to conflicts of interest regarding work on stockpiles, historical stockpiles form a different scope to the specified scope in the call for an ITWMP. Thus we have the right to be participating and advising whomever approaches us in that space.</p> <p>I would like to make it clear to the Forum that you had an opportunity to work with us last year (2017). We have worked with you and you had the opportunity to work with another party and ourselves to develop this integrated plan and your response to not getting involved was because of perceived risks you saw in developing a turnkey solution. We had good engagement for two months and you expressed your personal preference to just be involved at the pre-processing phase and we mutually agreed to part ways based on these differences. The pursuit of this opportunity led us down the path of understanding all the requirements identified for this plan. I am surprised by the allegations presented today because you could have been represented up here with us today.</p> <p>We come from a background of financial services under the strict regime of the financial services board and we completely understand what conflicts of interest comprise, how to navigate them and have meaningful engagement as they arise. We will have these conversations with the Department and we are presenting ourselves transparently throughout the process. If this means completely removing ourselves from the historical</p>			Khotatso Moloi, Waste Tyre Forum (and Waste Beneficiation)

Meeting/Project Name:	Public Hearings on The Waste Tyre Management Plans		
Date of Meeting: (MM/DD/YYYY)	21/05/2018	Time:	09h00
		Location:	Environment House, (Departmental of Environmental Affairs Head Office), Pretoria
stockpiles, we will make that decision ourselves.			
<p>Question 6: What will be the impact of the current trucks we have bought if the plan is to minimise on transportation? How will TWAMISA ensure that the current secondary transporters' vehicles will be transformed to support OTR waste tyres? There is specialised equipment to carry OTR trucks; what will TWAMISA do to ensure that the current transporters conform to the requirements of OTR tyre specifications?</p> <p>Answer 6: Our plan proposes to unlock a completely new value chain which currently doesn't exist – especially in the areas TWAMISA aims to cover. So it will in no way result in a reduction of the business directed at current participants. If anything it may increase business for current transporters. In terms of upgrading secondary transporters for OTR – we will support and guide them where necessary to participate in the contract award process (i.e. certification in transporting abnormal loads).</p>			Motsatsi Thinyane, Waste Tyre Forum
<p>Question 7: What is your take on the suggestion that whoever wins the management plan has to put down a bond to secure event of failure (insurance against failure)? (Your plan states it requires more than R210 000 000 in public funds to set up its operation.)</p> <p>Answer 7: We answered this in the public participation forum in December 2017 (report is on the SAWIC website). We believe that the true success of any plan is measured with the alignment of the plan to stakeholders. At that time our answer was that we had not considered this approach, however we will take this under consideration. We believe that the true success of any plan will be determined by the alignment of interests of all the stakeholders and proper governance for the industry to move forward. We also don't believe that adding in additional controls above all the stated governance processes will result in an efficient use of funds allocated to the industry. <i>Khotatso Moloji commented:</i> I want to communicate that my position has always been against a conflict of interest. I withdrew to focus on processing and I believe I cannot be an industry manager should I have such interests.</p>			Victor Molefe, Waste Tyre Forum
<p>Question 8: This prospect is a low-hanging fruit opportunity for previously disadvantaged participants in this value chain – therefore if there isn't clarity on the revenue model and informal or previously disadvantaged participants are pushed out of the plan while processors are supported in their growth objectives, then there is a problem with this plan.</p> <p>Answer 8: N/A</p>			William Levi, SABAACI
<p>Question 9: Listening to both plans, it's apparent that they are based on some kind of terms of</p>			Kirik Pershin, Alfresco Trading (Processors)

Meeting/Project Name:	Public Hearings on The Waste Tyre Management Plans		
Date of Meeting: (MM/DD/YYYY)	21/05/2018	Time:	09h00
		Location:	Environment House, (Departmental of Environmental Affairs Head Office), Pretoria
<p>reference issued by the Waste Bureau, and from that I have a fundamental question: Once issued with funds from Treasury, who is going to guard the guardians and manage the managers? In other words, you receive this lump sum as was done with REDISA then what are specific KPIs and deliverables for which you will measure the use of funds and plan success? (Those measurables are not identifiable in your plan.)</p> <p>Answer 9: <i>DG Interjection</i> The way to help plan proponents is to share lessons learnt from REDISA, especially in relation to governance, NPOs, management companies, etc. The Department will go through those kinds of details in our meetings with the plan proponents. So I think it is sufficient for you to say you don't see the difference between current plans and REDISA and highlight those specific details for plan owners. However we'd also like to make the intentions of the process clear. <i>TWAMISA</i> I believe this plan is quite different from the REDISA plan. It revolves around a proper integration of the industry on several levels – we are integrating the interests of the users with the interests of the government. We are integrating existing industry in the form of those incubation partners with SMEs. We are integrating previously disadvantaged individuals via jobs and SMEs to enable participation in this highly specialised industry. We are enabling the introduction of new entrants (defined in the BEE codes) to the industry and allocating a portion of equity to such participants. <i>Kirik interjected to clarify questions:</i> Clarify your position on fund and KPI management by way of deliverables and measurables. <i>TWAMISA</i> We are proposing the NPC to be another layer of governance between ourselves and the Department and to provide a seat on the board to the Waste Bureau in our governance to guide our progress and deliverables towards the plan targets. We also are governed by the King IV report and we aim to appoint independent directors, of which posts will be advertised nationally in the hopes of making our proposals for governance transparent. Additionally, this is the first time we engage on the plans and we will take into consideration all the inputs put forward to incorporate into the plan.</p>			
<p>Question 10: The survival of the OTR model is dependent on numbers and volumes from the mines. So when you state that mines will choose their remediation partners, I believe that this approach will destabilise the objectives of your plan. We need to be able to convince the mines to agree on a supplier in a given place, else the whole process does not work for OTRs. Answer 10: This is exactly what we are trying to say – provide the mines with a predictable transparent solution which has been subjected to the scrutiny of the entire industry to address their historical stockpiles towards localised development and businesses, as well as true sustainability.</p>			Lehlogonolo Molloyi, MESO Group
<p>Question 11:</p>			Matelele Motloun, Lehloka General Trading

Meeting/Project Name:	Public Hearings on The Waste Tyre Management Plans		
Date of Meeting: (MM/DD/YYYY)	21/05/2018	Time:	09h00
		Location:	Environment House, (Departmental of Environmental Affairs Head Office), Pretoria
<p>As participants we are from different areas; and the area that I am from has been prioritised (Emfuleni Sedibeng) for air pollution targets since 2006. Tyre burning contributes greatly to air pollution.</p> <p>Why don't we look to government as consultants if they won't be in a process to manage the industry plans and we as business can provide inputs into a larger plan?</p> <p>We believe an ITWMP treats all participants uniformly, which is not the reality of the situation.</p> <p>Answer 11:</p> <p>We have answered the Department's call for proposals with specific parameters to address. So obviously we may not have taken into account all the nuances faced by individual participants. I don't know if that answers your question.</p> <p><i>Matelele interjected to clarify the question</i></p> <p>I am not surprised by that response.</p> <p>Let me refer to the lady running a depot in Tembisa. She cannot be treated the same as a depot run in an industrial area and their benefits cannot be the same; and we need to create entrepreneurs.</p> <p>People need to be given a platform to understand their context and supported to grow which I feel is best suited for a consulting body of the government; and I do not think that the current approach to an ITWMP plan addresses those nuances and the treatment of different participants.</p> <p><i>Facilitator's commentary</i></p> <p>I think that specific needs to be addressed by government.</p>			
Evergreen			Ebrahim Patel, Director
<p>Background story on Middelburg to advocate why the hub for an integrated waste plan should reside in Middelburg:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Middelburg is surrounded by 172 open cast and underground mines – implies access to OTR tyres • 9 surrounding power plants in Middelburg • Largest steel plant is in Middelburg <p>Business rationale:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Proposing a business model creating a pipeline of entrepreneurs with the aim of addressing the growing stockpiles for tyres • Possess experience in beneficiating outputs from the steel industry with water jet machines, done as private industry through the design of shared equipment scheme for entrepreneurs to cut and mould steel on a water jet machine • Pyrolysis plan to model after steel beneficiation plan – to create an operation that encourages shared resources and skills development to other smaller entities, encourage scaling and invariably create a hub of pyrolysis operators across Middelburg (eventually across South Africa) <p>Presentation on pyrolysis process:</p>			

Meeting/Project Name:	Public Hearings on The Waste Tyre Management Plans		
Date of Meeting: (MM/DD/YYYY)	21/05/2018	Time:	09h00
		Location:	Environment House, (Departmental of Environmental Affairs Head Office), Pretoria
<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Overview of Envirogreen: Ebrahim Patel (director), Ebrahim Seedat (scientist), Ayub Patel (engineer), Gareth Nel (scientist) • Combined experience of 45 years • Organisation was started due to their combined passion for science, environment and people <p>Pyrolysis process overview:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Products produced from pyrolysis – carbon black, crude oil, steel (easily accessible markets for steel) • Oil can be used for energy generation, additionally with a refinery plan, crude oil can be fractionally distilled to produce 7 other high-quality products like kerosene (jet fuel) <p>Vision: To become the leading recycled raw material company on the continent, by producing high-quality recycled raw material that meets industry standards, supporting research and development into new markets and sustaining existing markets.</p> <p>Mission:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Recycle waste tyres in an environmentally friendly manner, to help eliminate the mounting waste problem facing our country • Provide industry with high-quality recycled raw materials, so that the material can be absorbed by the market thereby turning a challenge into a solution • Create and grow existing markets for recycled products, to ensure the continued consumption of recycled products • Foster an environment that supports the creation of sustainable SMEs, and thus leads to more formal work for the communities <p>Operating model:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Aim to produce the following products: <ul style="list-style-type: none"> ○ 45-55% fuel oil ○ 30-35% carbon black ○ 10-15% steel wire ○ 8-10% gas 		George Mapuma, Director	
<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • We aim to address the historical and arising stockpiles, particularly as demand for products grows, by allocating 100% of tyres (stockpiles and arising) to pyrolysis • Key factor in driving demand is the presence of processors to refine product outputted from pyrolysis • Create new markets for products (SiC, bricks, fertiliser, etc.) <p>Social upliftment:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • A portion of the revenue will be used to create and sustain various community upliftment initiatives (bursaries, STEM facilities, skills development programmes, innovation centres, etc.) • Refinement and processing to carbon black and produce a suitable burning fuel <p>Business model – establish a single pilot from which others can model pyrolysis and downstream refinement processes:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Two 20T pyrolysis plant = recycle 14 400 tonnes per year • Plant 1 20T – OTR tyres 			

Meeting/Project Name:	Public Hearings on The Waste Tyre Management Plans		
Date of Meeting: (MM/DD/YYYY)	21/05/2018	Time:	09h00
		Location:	Environment House, (Departmental of Environmental Affairs Head Office), Pretoria
<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Plant 2 20T – passenger tyres Plants in same area Depot in proximity of plants Delivery of OTR and normal vehicle tyres separate <p>Supply of tyres – how we plan to acquire tyres:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> Comply with the approved waste tyre management appointees for acquisitions and logistics of the waste tyres Tyres at depot = 7 525 tonnes (REDISA stats) Potential supply of tyres in Mpumalanga is 70 000 tonnes per annum, which is ideal for the pilot's target The two plants will process 20% of estimated tonnage per annum 80% capacity addressable by other initiatives: <ul style="list-style-type: none"> Rubber tile production Rubber flooring Replication and learning opportunities of our business model by entrepreneurs 			
Question			Owner
Question 1: Your plant figures don't add up – are they based on the construction of a working plant? Answer 1: Not Answered			Louis Liebenberg, Earththread (Pty) Ltd.
Question 2: <i>Comment</i> My understanding is that we need to be developed and enhanced as an industry. Thus partnerships with Evergreen and industry should exist – they answer how the industry should grow but need input from industry. Answer 2: N/A			Matelele, Mehlabla General Trading
Question 3: I have a suggestion to resolve industry concerns. From the three plans, I wanted to contrast the value proposition against each other vis-à-vis REDISA. Can the three plan owners conglomerate, come together to safeguard our resources and hold each other to responsibility for performance? Answer 3: That would have to be a decision made by the Department but we are willing to participate in a collaborative plan.			Leonard Baile Mashinini, Waste Tyre Management Forum
Question 4: What is in it for us as industry participants? Answer 4: We believe our business plan satisfies SMME development, upskilling and innovation due to the fact that our model is replicable and our plant would need new skills as well as participants to capture the offtake from pyrolysis.			Personal details not provided

Meeting/Project Name:	Public Hearings on The Waste Tyre Management Plans		
Date of Meeting: (MM/DD/YYYY)	21/05/2018	Time:	09h00
		Location:	Environment House, (Departmental of Environmental Affairs Head Office), Pretoria
Question 5: The Waste Bureau is doing a good job – what is going to be the role of the WB once these plans get implemented? Answer 5:	Stanley Mangwagape, depot owner from Midrand		
Question 6: <i>Comment</i> You're not a complete plan – you are a processor downstream and should be an addendum to a plan. Answer 6: No we are not a plan, we are a project.	Hedie Judd		
Question 7: <i>Comment</i> I agree with my colleagues – if there is a plan it should be a managed by government and not an external party. On the topic of on intellectual property – us providing input to these plans is our own IP and so the argument of the protection of IP is moot. Answer 7: N/A	Sylvan Monsthyane, Zolfe consulting		
Question 8: <i>Comment</i> It seems as if current presenters are not taking risk for their own initiatives. Answer 8: We are not asking for funds to start our project; we are able to raise the R9 million required for our plan by ourselves. We are looking for access to tyres from both historical and arising stockpiles.	Personalised		
Question 9: <i>Comment</i> What we experienced with REDISA should not be repeated again. Answer 9:	Clayton Luckie, W.B ARNDD		
Question 10: The government's mandate said each plan owner should talk about their ability to collaborate with other plans. Can you comment on Evergreen's ability to do such? Answer 10: We are willing to collaborate with other plan managers upon the Department's approval, provided we get access to tyres as inputs into our pyrolysis project.	Banele Sekgwame		

Waste Bureau Presentation

Overview of Network

There exist over 2000 collection points inherited from REDISA. WMB cannot service all collection points due to capacity constraints regarding collection, storage and processing. There is an ongoing process to register dealers.

The number of dealers totals 225 across the country. Additionally there are 213 active micro-collectors, 23 micro depots, 67 primary transporters and 10 secondary transporters.

Operational Performance

We compared our performance to REDISA: between October 2017 and March 2018, the WMB collected 47 000 tonnes of waste tyres. When we annualised the figures (converted to show comparative performance over a year), the Waste Management Bureau collected just under 94 000 tonnes of tyres while REDISA collected just under 93 000 tonnes of tyres.

We achieved a 21.5% annualised recycling rate (as a percentage of waste tyres arising) versus REDISA's recycling rate of 14.9%.

Waste Bureau Successes

We achieved the following over a six-month period:

- Ensured the continuation of waste tyre operations from June 2017
- Utilised a lower operational cost compared to its performance
- Outperformed REDISA in collections and recycling
- Operated with fewer human resources – 34 people vs. 178 people associated with REDISA
- Achieved collection and recycling targets despite full depots and the prohibition of exports
- Onboarded industry participants efficiently
- Ensured the fast activation of new depots

Monitoring Framework

The framework we intend using when we change our role from operations to that of monitoring the plan, which is still a work in progress, is as follows:

- Baseline and target setting for 5 years
- Waste flow tracking
- Prioritisation of reuse and recycling
- Labour intensity assessment
- SMME development
- Effectiveness & impact assessment of the plan
- Measurement of cost efficiencies
- Adherence to levels of regulatory compliance for facilities / operations
- Skills development
- Projection of financial flows
- Production of externally audited financial statements
- Production of annual external performance audit
- Production of annual business plans
- Monthly & quarterly reporting

Nolwazi Tetyana, Specialist
Advisor, Waste Management
Bureau

Question	Owner
<p>Question 1: We were given the liquidation figures which don't correlate with the WMB's numbers. Why were the liquidator's number presented here?</p> <p>Answer 1: The 499 is the number the liquidator submitted to DEA of active micro-collectors when they took over. What WMB did was conduct an analysis on this number by contacting all participants registered on REDISA's database and validating active participants. This is how we eventually got to 213 active micro-collectors.</p>	<p>Victor Molefe, Waste Tyre Management Forum</p>
<p>Question 2: Is there room for more involvement from the part of retreaders in the current industry plan?</p> <p>Answer 2: The Waste Bureau welcomes further engagement on this with active retreaders, to establish how this can be done.</p>	<p>Personal details not provided</p>
<p>Question 3: Is the Waste Bureau planning to add more depots into the value chain to address stockpile issues?</p> <p>Answer 3: The Waste Bureau is awaiting the Minister's approval for a tender process to be initiated to address the intent to create more depots.</p>	<p>Personal details not provided</p>
<p>Next Steps:</p> <p>Requests for clarity from Proponents:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Requests for clarity by plan owners must be made in writing to the Department • Written requests will also be received and reviewed by the Department • Please send an email to Mr Anben Pillay APillay@environment.gov.za for such requests <p>Written comments from interested and affected parties:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Written comments on the plans should be submitted to Ms Mamogala Musekene MJMusekene@environment.gov.za; Environment House, 473 Steve Biko Street, Arcadia, Pretoria or Department of Environment Affairs, Private Bag X 447, Pretoria, 0001 <p>The deadline for all written commentary is 7th June 2018</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • The DEA, Waste Bureau and other relevant government departments (DTI, Treasury, etc.) will convene a special meeting to interact with the plan owners for purposes of clarity after the last public hearing • Special meeting will be held between the 5th and 7th June 2018 • After receiving written comments by the closing date (7th June 2018), the Department will consolidate all written comments, which will then be sent to the plan owners • Comments received will also be published on the DEA website • Plan owners will be expected to respond to comments by addressing, upgrading or re-adjusting their plans within a specified timeframe • Once plans are re-submitted to the Minister, the Department will analyse the responses and compile a register against written comments • A final adjudication/review of the plans will be undertaken • Based on all above inputs and processes, the Minister will make a decision and publish a notice in a gazette 	